

Hawking as example of Physicist who tells us fairy stories

Roger J Anderton
R.J.Anderton@btinternet.com

Physicists seem to have a disregard for physics history, and instead of telling us what actual happened tell us a fairy story; this is one of the things that has totally corrupted understanding of physics to have its development misrepresented. Professor Hawking is highlighted as an example of a physicist that distorts physics history.

Philip Ball in reviewing Prof Hawking book "Brief Answers to the Big Questions" [1] after pointing out sloppiness on other things by Hawking then tells us:

"There's a sloppiness to the history too, even in science: for instance, he perpetuates the myth that Max Planck postulated the quantum to avoid the 'ultraviolet catastrophe' of black body radiation. Planck never mentioned it in his proposal."

Others than Hawking tell us this myth. But if go to a historian of science/physics then do not get that story, for instance: Historian Helge Kragh [2] says:

"According to the standard story, which is unfortunately still found in many physics textbooks, quantum theory emerged when it was realized that classical physics predicts an energy distribution for black-body radiation that disagrees violently with that found experimentally. In the late 1890s, so the story continues, the German physicist Wilhelm Wien developed an expression that corresponded reasonably well with experiment — but had no theoretical foundation. When Lord Rayleigh and James Jeans then analysed black-body radiation from the perspective of classical physics, the resulting spectrum differed drastically from both experiment and the Wien law. Faced with this grave anomaly, Max Planck looked for a solution, during the course of which he was forced to introduce the notion of "energy quanta". With the quantum hypothesis, a perfect match between the-credited for being the first person to realize that theory and experiment was obtained. Voila! Quantum theory was born. The story is a myth, closer to a fairy tale than to historical truth. Quantum theory did not owe its origin to any failure of classical physics, but instead to Planck's profound insight in thermodynamics."

Note the word “fairy tale”, rather than give us accurate history there are in “many physics textbooks” this “fairy tale” about Max Planck. Prof Hawking is example of one of these physicists who does not care about history of physics and tells us a “fairy tale”.

As Helge Kragh points out: “Indeed, the “discovery” of quantum theory should not be seen as a moment of insight in December 1900, but as an extended process by many physicists.”

So, what harm has being told the “fairy tale” instead of the actual history (?)

Well it was “extended process by many physicists” and it hides from the attention of the majority (the majority who have been taught the “fairy tale”) that it came from Boscovich, and Boscovich was a unified theory of physics. [3]

References

[1] An ordinary genius, Philip Ball, New Scientist 20 October 2018 p. 45

[2] Max Planck: the reluctant revolutionary, Helge Kragh, Physics World Dec 2000 p. 31
<https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/7aeb/37159b682b0e5ce54cdeb2834ccb4dbcd5be.pdf>

[3] For Boscovich see for example: Roger Boscovich The Founder of Modern Science, Dragoslav Stoiljkovich, Lulu books
<http://www.lulu.com/shop/roger-anderton-and-dragoslav-stoiljkovich/roger-boscovich-the-founder-of-modern-science/paperback/product-21684660.html>

c.RJAnderton04Nov2018