

**Einstein's Theory.**—T. J. J. See, in the following "Letter to the Editor", attempts to demolish the Einstein Theory by showing that it violates the law of the "Conservation of Energy."

LETTER TO THE EDITOR.

In the Scientific Journals I notice much vague discussion of Einstein's Theory, without any indication that Einstein's Theory really violates the *Conservation of Energy*, and therefore is invalid, and must be definitely rejected. Here is the proof.

1. The whole of Einstein's speculation reposes on Gerber's formula for the Potential (*Zeitschrift für Mathematische Physik*, Band XLIII, 1898, pp. 93-104):

$$V = k^2 mm^2 / r (1 - dr/cdt)^2 = (k^2 mm^2 / r) [1 + 2dr/dt + (3/c^2) (dr/dt)^2 + \dots] \quad (1)$$

2. Now in his great *Treatise on Electricity and Magnetism*, 1873, Section 856, Maxwell gives a profound and conclusive discussion of Weber's Fundamental Electrodynamical Law of 1846, of which the Potential is:

$$V = (k^2 mm^2 / r) [1 - (1/c^2) (dr/dt)^2] \quad (2)$$

3. Maxwell answers the objections which had been made to Weber's Law by Helmholtz, Lord Kelvin, and Tait so thoroughly that they give up the claim that it did not conform to the Conservation of Energy. The Analysis of Maxwell was afterwards approved by the great French mathematicians Bertrand, Tisserand, and Poincaré, and therefore we know this formula (2) is valid in the physical theory of the Universe. In fact formula (2) represents the Potential due to wave-field, and thus points to the Wave-Theory of Physical Forces.

4. But as formula (1) is inconsistent with formula (2) we see immediately that the Gerber formula must be definitely rejected. Hence the whole of Einstein's Theory falls to the ground.

T. J. J. SEE

Naval Observatory, Mare Island, California.  
January 14, 1922.

---

**New Comet discovered January 20.**—After the forms for this issue of POPULAR ASTRONOMY were made up, the following announcement was received of a comet discovered at the Cape of Good Hope on January 20. The comet is very faint and too far south for northern observers to secure satisfactory observations. No statement is given as to the direction of its motion.

"Brussels cables very faint comet discovered January twenty at Cape position January twenty four decimal three nine eight eight Greenwich mean time ascension nine hours fifty four minutes thirty and nine tenths seconds south thirty three degrees forty six minutes. Harlow Shapley. Cambridge, Mass., January 28-29."

The position thus given for the comet is: R. A. 9<sup>h</sup> 54<sup>m</sup> 30<sup>s</sup>.9; Dec. —33° 46'; in the southern constellation Antlia, which contains no bright star. It is above our horizon when near the meridian.